PLANNING COMMITTEE - Date: 29 March 2017

Report of the Executive Head for Economic Development, Planning and Sustainability.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ref: C2016/75718/HHA</th>
<th>WARD: C14 / CAR STH &amp; CLOCK</th>
<th>Time Taken: 22 weeks, 0 days</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Site: 12 Pine Walk, Carshalton, SM5 4HB</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proposal: Erection of a part one, part two storey rear extension involving conversion of garage into a habitable room, alterations to front elevation, formation of a first floor dormer extension at side and alterations to existing roof. Provision of a car port at front, and creation of a new vehicular access onto Pine Walk incorporating alterations to front boundary wall piers and gates up to a maximum height of 1.4m.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applicant: Mr D Varley</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agent: Graham Ash</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Recommendation:

GRANT PLANNING PERMISSION

Summary of why the proposal is acceptable:

- The size, scale and massing of the proposed development is considered to be acceptable and the detailed design of the building would respect its local context and would not cause harm to the Pine Walk Area of Special Local Character or the street scene.
- The proposed development would not result in harm to the amenity of the neighbouring occupiers.
- The proposed development would not result in harm to trees of amenity value.
- The development would not adversely impact on highway safety or parking within the surrounding area.

Reason for Report to Committee: The application was de-delegated by Councillor Crowley.

1.0 BACKGROUND

1.1 Site and surroundings:

1.2 The application site comprises a two storey detached dwelling located on western side of Pine Walk. The site falls within the Pine Walk Area of Special Local Character (ASLC) which is described in the Site Development Policies DPD as having unique characteristics in a landscape setting of exceptional quality with an overall character and high townscape value that make an important contribution to the borough. Characteristic of Pine Walk is the tree lined central verge with carriageway either side and residential dwellings set within deep plots.
1.3 Although there is an established front building line along the eastern side of Pine Walk, the front building line on the western side of Pine Walk is distorted by the curvature of the road and by the siting of dwellings on West Way. As such, the frontage of 12 Pine Walk is in line with the frontage of 10 Pine Walk to the north, but set back from the frontages of 14, 16 and 18 Pine Walk to the south.

1.4 12 Pine Walk occupies a rectangular plot and is set back from the roadside by 16.5m with a rear garden of 31.2m in length. The building measures 16.3m wide and occupies much of the width of its frontage, being set in by 0.3m and 1.7m from the northern and southern side boundaries, respectively.

1.5 The dwelling comprises a hipped cat-slide roof measuring 8.05m in height to ridge and 4.6m in height to eaves. The principal elevation incorporates an integrated garage and a two storey projection measuring 5.5m in height. The building incorporates fenestration at ground floor and first floor, arranged symmetrically, in addition to a front entrance door. The principal elevation is finished in stone render at ground floor and white render at first floor with the front projection finished in red brickwork.

1.6 At the rear, the ground floor of the building incorporates a door and two window units as well as three sets of French doors that open onto a terrace. At first floor, the building incorporates two dormer windows with a third window contained within a first floor gable projection that measures 7.25m to ridge and 5m to eaves. Additionally, the gable projection contains a smaller circular window that is sited so as not to disrupt the visual balance achieved by the three main first floor windows.

1.7 At the side elevations, the building incorporates three ground floor windows on the southern elevation and none on the northern side elevation. By contrast, the southern side elevation of the neighbouring property to the north, 10 Pine Walk, incorporates five windows at ground floor in addition to a rooflight and a dormer window at first floor. The ground floor windows are secondary windows that serve dual-aspect rooms at the front and rear of the property. The rooflight is obscure glazed and serves a first floor landing and the dormer window serves a bedroom.

1.8 The gradient of the land is such that the site sits 1m higher than 10 Pine Walk at the principal elevation and 1.2m higher at the rear elevation. The neighbouring property to the south, 14 Pine Walk, is set on a higher gradient than the application site.

1.9 A mature Oak street tree is located to the front of the property and is prominent within the street scene. A damson tree is located within the rear garden against the boundary with 10 Pine Walk.

1.10 **Relevant Planning History:**

1.11 The application site has no planning history pertinent to the current application.

1.12 **Site specific designation:**

- Pine Walk Area of Special Local Character;
- Locally Important Geological Site.
2.0 APPLICATION PROPOSALS

2.1 Details of Proposal:

2.2 The application proposes the erection of a part one, part two storey rear extension, the formation of a side dormer extension, the conversion of a garage into a habitable room with the erection of a car-port in front. The application includes alterations to the principal elevation of the dwelling and the provision of a canopy porch in addition to widening an existing vehicular access and creating a new access with alterations to a front boundary wall and associated landscaping.

2.3 The single storey element would project 4.15m and incorporate a mono-pitch roof that would slope from 4.2m in height to the existing eaves height of 3.35m. The single storey projection would incorporate a 'garden room' at the rear that would project a further 3.6m with a flat roof at a height of 2.85m.

2.4 The two storey element would project 4.8m, maintaining the ridge and eaves heights of the existing rear gable projection. The two storey extension would incorporate a 'loggia' at rear that would project a further 3.9m with a flat roof at a height of 3.15m. The two storey rear extension would be set in from the shared boundary to the north by 3.6m.

2.5 The dormer to the northern side elevation would measure 4.08m wide at a height of 4.08m with eaves of 5.38m in height.

2.6 The car port would project 2.95m from the principal elevation with a pitched roof at a height of 4.1m.

2.7 The alterations to the principal elevation include the creation of a canopy porch above the existing front door, the re-rendering of the ground floor in white render with tile hanging at first floor. The front tower feature would be re-rendered in white with a lead finial installed above. An existing chimney to the northern side elevation would be demolished and an external chimney would be reinstated to the southern side elevation. The side dormer would incorporate tile hanging. At the rear elevation, the 'loggia' would be finished in white render, the 'garden room' would be finished in brickwork and the first floor of the two storey rear extension would be finished in weatherboarding.

2.8 Significant amendments to application since submitted:

2.9 None.

3.0 PUBLICITY

3.1 Adjoining Occupiers Notified

3.2 Method of Notification:

3.3 Letters were sent to 6 neighbouring occupiers dated 28 November 2016.

3.4 Number of Letters Received:
3.5 8 Letters of objection have been received from five addresses; 15 Fairway (two letters), 10 Pine Walk (three letters submitted on behalf of), 14 Pine Walk, 10 Southway, and 42 Southway.

3.6 The representations cite the following material considerations:

- Loss of daylight and sunlight to 10 Pine Walk;
- Loss of privacy to 14 Pine Walk;
- The height and bulk of the proposal would be excessive;
- The design of the proposal is not in keeping with the character of the surrounding area and would cause harm to the ASLC;
- Would cause harm to a street tree.

3.7 Official Consultation:

3.8 Senior Highways Engineer:

3.9 The Senior Highways Engineer was consulted and raised no objection to the proposal.

3.10 Principal Tree Officer

3.11 No objection subject to conditions.

3.12 Councillor Representation:

3.13 Councillor Crowley de-delegated the planning application on the 16 December 2016 stating that the Committee should assess the size and massing of the proposal as well as the impacts upon the amenities of the two neighbouring properties, 10 and 14 Pine Walk.

4.0 MATERIAL PLANNING POLICIES

4.1 Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 states that when determining a planning application, regard is to be had to the development plan, and the determination shall be made in accordance with the development plan, unless material considerations indicate otherwise. The development plan for the London Borough of Sutton comprises the following documents:

- The London Plan 2016
- The Core Planning Strategy 2009
- The Site Development Policies DPD 2012

4.2 Also a material consideration in determining planning applications are:

- National Planning Policy Framework
- National Planning Policy Guidance
- Adopted London Borough of Sutton Supplementary Planning Guidance documents.
- Draft Local Plan December 2016.
- Human Rights Act 1998
4.3 Material Planning Policies are listed below:

4.4 The London Plan Spatial Development Strategy for Greater London:

- 3.3 Increasing Housing Supply
- 3.4 Optimising housing potential
- 3.5 Quality and design of housing development (tables 3.2 & 3.3)
- 3.9 Mixed and balanced communities
- 3.14 Existing Housing
- 5.1 Climate change mitigation
- 5.2 Minimising carbon dioxide emissions
- 5.3 Sustainable design and construction
- 5.7 Renewable energy
- 5.12 Flood risk management
- 5.13 Sustainable drainage
- 5.15 Water use and supplies
- 6.1 Strategic approach
- 6.3 Assessing effects of development on transport capacity
- 6.9 Cycling
- 6.10 Walking
- 6.13 Parking
- 7.1 Lifetime neighbourhoods
- 7.2 An inclusive environment
- 7.3 Designing out crime
- 7.4 Local character
- 7.5 Public realm
- 7.6 Architecture

4.5 Core Planning Strategy:

- PMP1 Housing Provision
- PMP2 Suburban Heartlands
- BP1 Housing Density
- BP9 Enabling Smarter Travel Choices an Area–Based Approach
- BP10 Transport Strategic and Borough Wide Proposals
- BP12 Good Urban Design and Heritage

4.6 Site Development Policies:

- DM1 Character and Design
- DM2 Protecting Amenity
- DM3 Enhancing the Street Scene & Public Realm
- DM4 Historic Environment
- DM6 Climate Change Mitigation
- DM7 Flood Risk
- DM8 Climate Change Adaption
- DM9 Water Supply, Water Quality and Sewerage Infrastructure
- DM19 Promoting Sustainable Transport & Accessibility
- DM20 Assessing the Transport Impact of New Development
- DM22 Parking
4.7 Supplementary Planning Documents:

- SPD14 Creating Locally Distinctive Places 'Urban Design'

5.0 PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS

5.1 The principal considerations (including whether any material planning objections have been reasonably addressed) in relation to this application are:

- Principle
- Design Quality
- Impact on Neighbours
- Trees
- Highways & Parking

5.2 Principle:

5.3 Policy 3.14 of the London Plan supports optimising housing potential subject to local context and character and states that development proposals which compromise this policy should be resisted. At the local level, Policy DM4 of the Site Development Policies DPD states that planning permission will only be granted for development that respects the key elements that contribute to the character of the area, and states that developments should be designed in a way that respects the setting and reinforces the distinctiveness of the adjoining heritage designation.

5.4 The landscape setting of the Pine Walk Area of Special Local Character is of exceptional quality and the application site contributes to the character and appearance of the surrounding area as part of a larger street block.

5.5 There are various examples of side extensions along Pine Walk. However, rear extensions to the depth of the proposed development are not common. It is noted that the sides of the proposed 'loggia' would be open thus providing permeability between the extension and the rear garden. Furthermore, the rear extension would not be visible from the street scene. As such, the development would be acceptable in principle subject to compliance with other policies in terms of design quality, impact on neighbouring amenity, landscaping, and highways considerations. These matters are discussed below.

5.6 Design Quality:

5.7 Policy DM1 of the Site Development Policies DPD states that new development, including residential extensions, should complement or improve the character of the area through the use of high quality architectural design and layouts, ensuring integration with the surrounding buildings, together with the use of high quality materials. Policy DM1 goes on to state that the successful integration of new development is a fundamental
planning consideration. However, new development does not have to replicate the form and design styles of the existing development to achieve successful integration, and innovative design solutions of high quality should be encouraged. In addition, Policy DM3 requires all new development to contribute positively to the street scene in terms of its design and appearance.

5.8 Polices BP12 and PMP2 of the adopted Core Planning Strategy state that the Council will seek to ensure that developments respect local context as well as maintaining and enhancing the quality of the environment. Policy PMP 9 relates to the Open Spaces Network and the protection, safeguarding and enhancement thereof.

5.9 The proposed site is within the Pine Walk Area of Special Local Character and, as such, planning permission will only be granted for development that respects the key elements that contribute to the character of the area.

5.10 The proposed part one part two storey rear extension would serve as a natural extension of the existing roofline, maintaining and extending the rear gable at first floor and the low eaves at ground floor. It is considered that the proposal would relate sympathetically to the existing roofscape. It is considered that the proposed extension would relate subordinately to the host dwelling and would not cause harm to the street scene or the Pine Walk Area of Special Local Character.

5.11 The proposed side dormer extension would be set back from the principal elevation with a window to the rear that would correspond with the fenestration to the rear elevation. The proposed dormer would be visible from the front elevation but would relate subordinately to the existing dwelling. Furthermore, it is noted that the proposed dormer window could be constructed under permitted development in accordance with the restrictions and conditions of Schedule 2, Part 1, Class B of The Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 2015 (as amended). In light of the above, it is considered that the proposed dormer window would be acceptable in terms of its design quality.

5.12 The proposed car-port would project forward of the principal elevation. However, the existing dwelling is set-back from Pine Walk and is less visible within the street scene than the immediate neighbours to the south. Furthermore, the car-port would be an open canopy structure and, as such, it is considered that the car-port would not detract from the character and appearance of the existing dwelling or be overly prominent within the street scene.

5.13 Furthermore, it is considered that the proposed changes to the boundary treatment including the widening of an existing gated access and the creation of a new gated access with associated alterations to a front boundary wall would not adversely affect the appearance of the dwelling or the Pine Walk Area of Special Local Character. As such, it is considered that the proposed boundary treatment would be acceptable.

5.14 It is considered that the proposed canopy porch to the principal elevation is acceptable in terms of its design and impact on the character and appearance of the dwelling. The proposed demolition of the chimney to the northern side elevation and the reinstatement of an external chimney to the southern side elevation is considered to be acceptable in design terms.
5.15 The surrounding dwellings in the local area are of varying external finishes, with white render and plain brickwork being the most predominant. It is considered that the materials and finishes proposed to the dwelling would be in keeping with the character and appearance of surrounding buildings. It is recommended to attach a condition to any grant of consent requiring details of the external materials be submitted to the Local Planning Authority for approval to ensure that materials and finishes used are of an appropriately high standard.

5.16 For the reasons above the proposal is considered to be of an acceptable design, that respects the local context of the area, in regard to its scale and massing, and general architectural features, and would not cause harm to the character of the surrounding area, or the street scene.

5.17 **Impact on Neighbours:**

5.18 Site Development Policy DM2 states that the Council will not grant planning permission for any development that adversely affects the privacy, outlook or daylight and sunlight of adjoining occupiers, or would unacceptably impact on the surrounding area.

5.19 The proposed rear extension is located close to the boundary of 10 Pine Walk. The ground level at 10 Pine Walk is lower than that of the application site. The existing setbacks from the boundary line would be maintained and the proposal would not include any side facing windows to the northern elevation.

5.20 A daylight and sunlight report, commissioned by the occupants of the neighbouring property, 10 Pine Walk, has been submitted in support of an objection to the proposed development. In its assessment of the potential for an overshadowing impact upon 10 Pine Walk, the report states that:

- “the proposed rear extension exceeds the 45° in plan but satisfies the guideline in elevation. Other parts of the proposed extension satisfy the guidelines in both plan and elevation. From this preliminary review, it therefore appears that the proposed extension is unlikely to materially impact on skylight reaching the main windows of the front and rear living spaces of 10 Pine Walk”.

5.21 Regarding the impact on light to the side facing bedroom window in the flank dormer of 10 Pine Walk, it is acknowledged that the proposed development would result in harm above that recommended by the BRE guidance. However, this window faces the boundary with 12 Pine Walk and forms a poor neighbourly relation with the adjacent property borrowing light from the application site. These types of windows are commonly not afforded the same degree of protection as the front or rear facing windows of main habitable rooms such as living rooms and kitchens. It is also important to note that the BRE guidance advises that bedrooms are not expected to maintain the same level of daylighting as living rooms or kitchens. In light of the above, it is not considered that the development would result in a level of material harm that would support a reason for refusal on the grounds of loss of light.

5.22 10 Pine Walk incorporates a number of side facing windows in the southern elevation. The ground floor windows are secondary windows within dual-aspect rooms. It is
considered that the development would not adversely affect the outlook of, or the provision of daylight and sunlight to, these ground floor windows. It is considered that the outlook, privacy and provision of daylight and sunlight of the first floor side dormer of 10 Pine Walk would not be significantly adversely affected by the proposed development.

5.23 The proposed development would not incorporate any side facing windows to the northern elevation. As such, it is considered that the proposal would not adversely impact on the privacy of the occupiers of 10 Pine Walk.

5.24 In light of the above, it is considered that the proposed development would not cause a significant adverse impact upon the amenities of 10 Pine Walk by way of loss of daylight or sunlight, loss of privacy, or otherwise.

5.25 The application incorporates a window on the first floor southern side elevation of the rear extension is proposed along with bi-folding doors at ground floor. The extension would be to the north of the rear elevation with a significant separation distance to the neighbouring property to the south, 14 Pine Walk. Furthermore, the application site is set back from 14 Pine Walk and at a lower gradient. As such, it is considered that the proposed development would not adversely impact on the privacy of 14 Pine Walk.

5.26 For the reasons above it is considered that the proposed development would not result in harm to the amenity of the neighbouring occupiers.

5.27 **Trees:**

5.28 The application proposes to fell a mature tree that is located within the rear garden adjacent to the northern side boundary. The tree is screened from public view and, as such, does make a significant contribution to the local amenity or the street scene. Moreover, the tree is of an advanced age and in poor health and is therefore unlikely to contribute to the amenity of the area in the future. In light of the above, it would not be considered expedient to make the tree the subject of a Tree Preservation Order (TPO) and the felling of the tree is considered acceptable.

5.29 The Council’s Principal Tree Officer has reviewed the application and has raised no objection to the development subject to planning conditions to ensure the protection of the street tree during construction.

5.30 **Highways & Parking:**

5.31 Site Development Policy DM22 and Core Policy BP10 state that new developments will be expected to provide the appropriate amount of car parking necessary in accordance with the Council’s restraint-based maximum car and cycle parking standards, whilst the conversion of existing parking spaces to other uses should demonstrate that parking is surplus to requirements and would not result in additional on-street parking.

5.32 The development would provide space to accommodate three parked cars, one beneath the car-port and two on an area of hardstanding, in line with the Council’s restraint based parking standards.

5.33 The Council’s Senior Transport Planner has reviewed the proposal and has noted that
visibility splays of 2m in either direction must be maintained at all times and that any gates should open inwards so as not to obstruct the public highway. The Senior Transport Officer has raised no objection to the proposed development.

5.34 Therefore, the proposal is considered acceptable and would not prejudice highway safety or parking provision within the surrounding area.

5.35 CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

5.36 The size, scale and massing of the proposed development is considered to be acceptable and the detailed design of the building would respect its local context and would not cause harm to the Pine Walk Area of Special Local Character or the street scene. The proposed development would not result in harm to the amenity of the neighbouring occupiers. The proposed development would not result in harm to trees of amenity value nor would the development adversely impact on highway safety or parking within the surrounding area.

5.37 It is therefore recommended that the application be granted planning permission.

Background Papers: C2016/75718/HHA

Drawings and other documents can be viewed on line –

1) Go to page: http://gis.sutton.gov.uk/FASTWEB/welcome.asp
2) Enter Planning Application Number: C2016/75718
3) Click on Search and View Current Applications
4) Click on View Plans & Documents
WARNING: It is in your interests to ensure you obtain the approval of the Local Planning Authority, where the conditions require that to occur. Failure to comply with the following conditions may lead to enforcement action to secure compliance.

FIRST SCHEDULE

12 PINE WALK  Carshalton  SM5 4HB

Erection of a part one, part two storey rear extension involving conversion of garage into a habitable room, alterations to front elevation, formation of a first floor dormer extension at side and alterations to existing roof. Provision of a car port at front, and creation of a new vehicular access onto Pine Walk incorporating alterations to front boundary wall piers and gates up to a maximum height of 1.4m.

SECOND SCHEDULE

(1) The development must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date hereof.

Reason: To comply with Section 91 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990, as amended.

(2) The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans: PW 752-001 A, PW 752-002 A, pw 752-003 A, PW 752-004 A, PW 752-005, Design and Access Statement.

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and in the interests of proper planning.
(3) No work on the superstructure of the development hereby permitted shall take place until details of the materials and finishes to be used within the external elevations of the building and including windows and doors have been submitted to, and approved in writing by, the Local Planning Authority. The development shall thereafter be carried out in accordance with the approved materials.

Reason: To safeguard the visual amenity of the area in accordance with Policy DM1 of the Site Development Policies DPD.

(4) All trees shown to be retained shall be protected during the course of construction in accordance with the recommendations within British Standard BS 5837 2012 Trees in Relation to Design, Demolition and Construction. Protective fencing and/or ground protection measures shall be installed prior to the commencement of works or storage of materials on site.

Reason: To ensure the adequate protection of trees that make a valuable contribution to the character of the area and to ensure compliance with policy DM1 of the Site Development Policies DPD.

INFORMATIVES.

(1) This approval only grants permission under section 57 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990. Further approval or consent may be required by other legislation, in particular the Building Regulations and you should contact Building Control on 020 8770 5000 before proceeding with the work.

(2) This application has been assessed against the relevant policies of the London Plan 2016, Sutton's Core Planning Strategy 2009 and the Site Development Policies DPD 2012. The proposal is generally in accordance with Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 (as amended) and for this reason planning permission is granted.

(3) The applicant was provided with pre application advice. As the submitted application accorded with that advice and complied with the relevant policies Sutton Council has accordingly granted planning permission.

(4) The applicant’s attention is drawn to the fact that a separate application to the Highways Department is required for the creation of a new vehicular crossover.