

APPENDIX C

Charles Cryer Centre

Analysis of bid returns for shortlisting

Criteria set out in bidding instructions;

- Amount of rent
- Length of lease/any other terms
- Financial position of proposed tenant
- Longer-term sustainability of proposals
- Delivery of community and/or cultural benefit if appropriate
- Risk of business or activity failure
- Planning considerations and likelihood of gaining any consent needed
- Conditions attaching to the bid if any.

Weighting was not specified.

The first three of the above criteria are considered in an Exempt appendix, the remainder are considered below.

Bidder	Carshalton Baptists	Cryer Arts	Nickel Support
<u>Criteria:</u>			
Longer-term sustainability of proposals	Considered good	Considered good subject to new business/financial risk	Considered good
Comments	Lease for Strawberry Lodge now in place and rent supports this proposal.	Heavily reliant on income from bar and restaurant. Projections considered to be ambitious	Relies on sustainability of business post capital injection from James Trust. Relies on

			continued existence of collective
Delivery of community and/or cultural benefit if appropriate - scored based on standard Council social value analysis	Score 25 out of possible 30	Poor - scored 4 out of possible 30	Scored 23/30
Comments	<p>Good on basis of standard form.</p> <p>Stakeholder panels felt many positive aspects however faith-based identity might be less encouraging of a fully inclusive use.</p>	<p>Were asked to resubmit standard form but declined to do so as consider they are offering market rent.</p> <p>Stakeholder panels both considered this the favourite proposal by a clear margin. Entertainment and food/beverage based with good ancillaries.</p>	<p>Good on basis of standard form.</p> <p>Stakeholder panels appreciated enthusiasm of the Collective and felt bid had many good qualities. However there was a strong emphasis in use for families/children - possibly at the expense of evening uses and fuller inclusivity.</p>
Risk of business or activity failure	Risk felt to be low in all the circumstances.	Need to reflect element of risk for new business although operators are well established and experienced.	Risk considered low overall in early stages with James trust support.
Comments	Relocation of existing local church already with good local support. Transfers much of existing operation which has been running from Strawberry Lodge. Income from rents, donations and other activities.	Based heavily on bar and restaurant. Excellent experience on the field demonstrated however always possibility of wider economic factors or lower than expected take up.	Part established business, part new. Projections supporting a sustainable future after that stage depend on continued profitability and are not excessively ambitious however there is much competition locally for fitness, parent/child business.

Planning considerations and likelihood of gaining any consent needed			
Comments	Change of use required but being displaced from Strawberry Lodge rather than new additional activity	Not needed unless bar/restaurant requires change from restaurant	Little change from existing but may require change for workshop/retail proposals
Conditions attaching to the bid if any			
Comments	Planning Permission required CIO company structure however on basis of above factors risk of failure not considered high	Building inspections/surveys including services	N/A
Comments	An established local church with associated community activities and an excellent response to our community benefit analysis. Financial strength and likelihood of long-term use of property considered good overall. Panels felt faith-based use might restrict inclusivity. Would effectively move existing operation from Strawberry Lodge to the High Street rather than establish a new additional venue.	Excellent local business background in this proposal, also plausible ideas. Some risk attaching to new venture and tight budgets for expenditure. Poor response to community benefit analysis however strong favourite of stakeholder panel. Felt the most likely to create a “destination venue” and increased vitality. Also the best financial offer.	Good use proposals and community benefit. Financially strong through support of James Trust. Second favourite of stakeholder panels. Over five years second highest financial offer. Panels felt proposal was very strong for families/children but less so for other potential users and would compete with existing availability in Carshalton.

This page is intentionally left blank